Case: 1:23-cv-05099 Document #: 24-3 Filed: 09/06/23 Page 1 of 21 PageID #:709

EXHIBIT C

IN THE PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION PETITION COURT ABUJA JUDICIAL DIVISION HOLDEN AT ABUJA ON FRIDAY THE 23RD DAY OF JUNE, 2023 BEFORE THEIR LORDSHIPS

HON. JUSTICE H. S. TSAMMANI	CHAIRMAN
HON. JUSTICE S. J. ADAH	MEMBER 1
HON. JUSTICE M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF	MEMBER 2
HON. JUSTICE B. M. UGO	MEMBER 3
HON. JUSTICE A. B. MOHAMMED	MEMBER 4

CA/PEPC/05/2023

BETWEEN

ABUBAKAR ATIKU & ANOR

AND

IND. NATIONAL ELECTORAL COMMISSION & 2 ORS.

Ikechukwu Osuoha; Esq (Deputy National Legal Adviser) represents the 2nd Petitioner.

Chris Maigida; Esq (Deputy Director, Legal Services) represents the 3rd Respondent.

Chief Chris Uche; SAN, Eyitayo Jegede; SAN, Nella Andem-Ewa Rabana; SAN, Joe Abrahams; SAN, Emeka Etiaba; SAN, Prof. Maxwell M. Gidado; SAN, Paul Harris Ogbole; SAN and Andrew M. Malgwi; SAN with Ahmed T. Uwais; Esq, Jude A. Daniel; Esq and Joshua H. Barka; Esq for the Petitioners.

A.B. Mahmoud; SAN, Dr. Kemi Pinheiro; SAN, Miannaya Essien; SAN, Abdullahi Aliyu; SAN, Sir Stephen Adehi; SAN, T.M. Inuwa; SAN, Alhassan Umar; SAN, Abdulaziz Sani; SAN and S. O. Ibrahim; SAN with Dr. Patricia Obi; Esq, Ayoleke Owolabi; Esq and Thaddeus Idenyi; Esq for the 1st Respondent.

Chief Wole Olanipekun; SAN, Emmanuel Ukala; SAN, Tanimo Molajo; SAN, Mike Igbokwe; SAN, Oladipo Okpeseyi; SAN, Chief Yomi Aliyu; SAN, Babatunde Ogala; SAN, Funmilayo Quadri; SAN with Rafiu Balogun; Esq, Michael O. Olanipekun; SAN and Akintola Makinde; Esq for the 2nd and 3rd Respondents.

Prince L.O. Fagbemi; SAN, Chief Afolabi Fashanu; SAN, Chief Mrs. Olabisi Soyebo; SAN, Solomon Umoh; SAN, Oluseye Opasanya; SAN, Olusola Oke; SAN, Adeniji Kazeem; SAN, Prof. Lawan Yusufari; SAN, Aliyu O Saiki; SAN, Chief Anthony Adeniyi; SAN and Lukman Fagbemi; SAN with Ibrahim Shafii; Esq, Folake Abiodun; Esq and Chuka Iguh; Esq for the 4th Respondent.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

CCD

3dD.	SGD.
M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF	S. J. ADAH
MEMBER 2	MEMBER 1
23/6/2023	23/6/2023
SGD.	SGD.
A.B. MOHAMMED	M. B. UGO
MEMBER 4	MEMBERS

SCD

A.B. MOHAMMED M. B. UGO
MEMBER 4 MEMBER 3
23/6/2023 23/6/2023

Chief UCHE: The matter is for continuation of the case for the Petitioners. I will hand over to Eyitayo – Jegede; SAN to conduct the proceedings.

JEGEDE: We seek to tender from the Bar, CTCs of Forms EC8As for 25 Local Government Areas of Delta State.

MAHMOUD: I yield to Miannaya Essien; SAN to conduct the proceedings.

ESSIEN:

We object to the admissibility of their documents. We

shall give our reasons in our Written Address.

Chief

OLANIPEKUN: Chief Yomi Aliyu will anchor this segment of the

proceedings.

ALIYU:

We object and will give our reasons later.

FAGBEMI:

Chief Anthony Adeniyi will anchor this segment of the

proceedings on behalf of the 4th Respondent.

ADENIYI:

We object to the admissibility of their documents.

COURT:

The bundles of CTCs of Forms EC8As from 25 Local

Government Areas of Delta State are admitted in

evidence. They are to be marked as Exhibits PAW1 –

PAW25 respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI **CHAIRMAN** 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

JEGEDE:

We seek to tender from the Bar, CTCs of Forms EC8As

in respect of 13 Local Government Areas of Ebonyi State

in evidence.

ESSIEN:

We object to the admissibility for reasons to be

advanced later in the course of our proceedings.

ALIYU:

We also object for reasons to be given in our Written

Address.

ADENIYI:

The 4th Respondent also object and will offer reasons at

the address stage.

COURT:

The bundles of CTCs of Forms EC8As from 13 Local

Government Aras of Ebonyi State listed in column 17 at pages 6 – 7 of the Petitioners'5th Schedule of Documents

are admitted in evidence as Exhibit PAX1 - PAX13

respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD.

M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2

23/6/2023

SGD.

S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1

23/6/2023

SGD.

A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023 SGD.

M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

JEGEDE:

We seek to tender the CTCs of Forms EC8As from 18

Local Government Areas of Edo State in evidence.

ESSIEN:

We object to the admissibility. We shall give our reasons

at the address stage.

ALIYU:

We also oppose the admissibility of the documents for

reasons to be given later.

ADENIYI:

We are objecting. Reasons to be given later.

COURT:

The bundles of CTCs of Forms EC8As from 18 Local

Government Areas of Edo State listed in column 19 at

page 9 of the Petitioners' Schedule of Documents are admitted in evidence as Exhibits PAY1 – PAY18 respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023 SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

JEGEDE:

We seek to tender the CTCs of Forms EC8As from 17

Local Government Areas of Enugu State in evidence.

ESSIEN:

We object to the admissibility of the documents.

Reasons to be advanced later.

ALIYU:

We also oppose and reasons will be given later.

ADENIYI:

We register our objection. We shall advance reasons

later.

COURT:

The bundles of CTCs of Forms EC8As from 17 Local Governments of Enugu State listed in column 21 at page 8 of the Petitioners'5th Schedule of Documents are admitted in evidence on Exhibits PAZ1 – PAZ17 respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023 SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

JEGEDE:

We seek to tender from the Barr, the Forms EC8As from

27 Local Government Areas of Imo State in evidence.

ESSIEN:

The 1st Respondent is opposed to the admissibility of

their documents. Reasons to be advanced later.

ALIYU:

We also object. Reasons to be given later.

ADENIYI:

We object and will proffer reasons later.

COURT:

The bundles of CTCs of Forms EC8As from 27 Local Government Areas of Imo State listed in column 24 of the Petitioners'5th Schedule of Documents are admitted in evidence and are to be marked as Exhibits PBA1 –

PBA27 respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023 **JEGEDE:** We apply to tender CTCs of Forms EC8A series from 221

Local Government Areas of Kogi State in evidence.

ESSIEN: We oppose the admissibility of their documents. We

shall give our reasons at the address stage.

ALIYU: We also object for reasons to be advanced later.

ADENIYI: We register our objection for reasons we shall advance

in our address.

COURT: The bundles of CTCs of Forms EC8As from 21 Local

Governments of Kogi State listed in column 28 at pages

10 – 11 of the Petitioner's Schedule of Documents are

admitted in evidence. They are to be marked as Exhibits

PBB1 - PBB21 respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. SGD.
M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF S. J. ADAH
MEMBER 2 MEMBER 1
23/6/2023 23/6/2023

SGD. SGD.
A.B. MOHAMMED M. B. UGO
MEMBER 4 MEMBER 3
23/6/2023 23/6/2023

JEGEDE: I apply in obedience to paragraph 46(4) of the 1st

Schedule to deem the documents admitted as having

read.

ESSIEN: We withhold our consent.

ALIYU: The 2nd & 3rd Respondents do not give any consent.

ADENIYI: The 4th Respondent also withhold consent.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023 SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

JEGEDE:

At this stage, I yield back to my leader Chief Chris Uche:

SAN.

UCHE:

We intend our nest witness who is on subpoena.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023 SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

P.W.27:

Christian/sworn on the Holy Bible and speaks English. My name is Mike Enahoro – Ebah. I live at N0.8, Nairobi Street, Off Aminu Kano Crescent, Wuse 2, Abuja. I am a Private Legal Practitioner. I am before this Court to testify on a subpoena. I have a copy of the subpoena in Court.

UCHE:

I apply to tender the subpoena in evidence.

MAHMOUD:

We have no objection.

OLANIPEKUN: I yield to E. UKala to handle this aspect of the

proceeding.

UKALA.

We have no objection.

FAGBEMI:

No objection.

COURT:

The subpoena duces tecum ad testificandum issued on

Micheal Enahoro is admitted as evidence as Exhibit PBC.

SGD.

H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD.

M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF

MEMBER 2 23/6/2023 SGD.

S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1

23/6/2023

SGD.

A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD.

M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

P.W.27

Continue:

I remember the 20/6/23. On that day, I came to this

Court and deposed to a witness statement.

document shown to me is my witness statement as it

has my signature and name. I seek to adopt my witness

statement as my evidence.

MAHMOUD:

We object to the witness adopting the statement on

grounds earlier argued.

UKALA:

object on the grounds argued in similar

circumstance earlier made.

FAGBEMI:

We also object on grounds earlier argued in similar

circumstances.

UCHE:

We also adopt our Replies on earlier grounds of similar

nature.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023 SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

PW27

CONTINUE:

I made reference to certain documents, to unit: paragraphs 11 of my witness statement. They are CTCs of Forms EC9 for the 2nd Respondent together with the receipt for the certification including my Application to INEC and the INCE Reply to my Application. Together with the Form EC9 is a certificate supposedly from Chicago State University came on NYSC certificate.

UCHE:

We seek to tender the Applications to INEC, (2) Pay Receipt from INEC, (3) Form EC9 of Tinubu Bola Ahmed, (4) Chicago State University Certificate and (5) A Certificate of NYSC in the name of Bola Tinubu Adekunle, and (6) Certificate of Service from Mobil oil Nig. Plc in evidence.

MAHMOUD: We object to the admissibility of their documents and

will give our reasons at the address stage.

OLANIPEKUN: On behalf of the 2nd Respondent, we object and will

advance our reasons in our final address.

FAGBEMI:

The 3rd Respondent objects and shall give reasons later.

COURT:

The documents tendered are admitted in evidence and they are to be marked as follows: -

- 1. The Affidavit in Support of the said Particulars (Form EC9) to be marked as Exhibit PBD1.
- 2. The Certificate of National Service as Exhibit PBD1 (a).
- 3. Chicago State University as Exhibit PBD1(b);
- The Certificate of Service issued in the name of Mr.
 A. Tinubu as Exhibit PBD1(c);
- 5. The Receipt for Payment of CTC of Forms EC13A and C9 to be marked as Exhibit PBD2.
- 6. The acknowledgment Letter for the Issuance of CTC of Documents in Exhibit PBD2(a).
- Copies of Applications for Certified True Copies (CTC)
 of Nomination Forms for Governor dated 13/7/22 and
 22/7/22 are to be marked as Exhibits PBD3 and PBD4
 respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD.
M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF
MEMBER 2
23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023 SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023 SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

P.W.27 CONTINUE:

I have the Academic Records of Bola Tinubu Ahmed. I made record of it in paragraph 17 of my Witness Statement. They are attached to the Forwarding Letter sent to me by my Counsel in the USA. There is also a subpoena served on the University. They are listed on (a) - (e) in paragraph 17 of my witness statement on oath.

UCHE:

We apply to tender the documents listed by the witness in paragraphs 15 and 17 of the witness statement.

MAHMOUD:

We object to the admissibility of the documents and will advance our reasons at the address stage.

UKALA:

We object to the admissibility of all their documents and will state our reasons in our final address.

FAGBEMI:

We also object to the admissibility of the documents for reasons to be advanced at the address stage.

COURT:

The bundle of documents containing;

- (a) A letter from Leavy, Eisenberg & Fraenkel Ltd. To Mr. Enaboro Ebah dated 01/2022,
- (b) Subpoena in a civil matter,
- (c) Chicago University Academic Record.
- (d) Certificate from Chicago State University in the name of Bola A. Tinubu;
- (e) Bundle of Transcripts or School records are admitted as Exhibits PBE1 PBE6 respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

UCHE:

We seek to tender a notarised judgment for civil

forfeiture and a copy of Guinean Passport in evidence.

MAHMOUD:

We reserve our reasons for objection for final address.

UKALA:

We are also objecting and will give our reasons later.

FAGBEMI:

We also object and we will give our reasons later.

COURT:

The Copy of Notarised judgment of the United State District Court, the Certificate pursuant to Section 84(2) & (4) of the evidence Act, the Affidavit of Nerdisa Muratagic and a photocopy of a Guineenne Passport in the name of Tinubu Bola Ahmed are admitted in evidence as Exhibits PBF1 – PBF4 respectively.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD.
M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF
MEMBER 2
23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023 SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

UCHE:

I seek that the Exhibits tendered and admitted be

deemed as having been read.

MAHMOUD:

We do not give our consent.

UKALA:

We do not give our consent.

FAGBEMI:

We also do not give our consent.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

UCHE:

That is all for the witness in chief.

CROSS-EXAMINATION By A.B. MAHMOUD:

I am a Patriotic Nigerian. On the election day I was in Abuja. I joined other Nigerians to vote on that date. I voted at Gwarimpa Primary School. After voting I left. I was duly accredited and I cast my vote. When I voted, I hoped that my vote would be respected.

The documents tendered through me, were obtained at different times. The forwarding letter of

those documents came on 01/11/22 while the judgment was received in April, 2022 from my Counsel, I am not sure of the date INEC published the final list of candidates I had no cause to lay any compliant to INEC. I do not know that I became very famous when I began my campaign against the 2nd Respondent. I did my work as a public interest litigator. I have not spent a lot of money in the cause of my investigation. The counsel in the USA did the work pro bino. There are many other Public Litigation causes in Nigeria. It is not correct that I have taken interest in the candidature of the 2nd Respondent.

I have not mentioned any other public Interest Litigation came in my statement. As announced by INEC, my candidate loss the election. It is not a pleasant outcome that my candidate lost the election.

COURT:

Cross-examination of PW27 will continue at 3.00 p.m. witness is therefore stood down for 3.00.p.m.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD.
M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF
MEMBER 2
23/6/2023

SGD.
A.B. MOHAMMED
MEMBER 4
23/6/2023

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023 CROSS-EXAMINATION
By Chief OLANIPEKUN:

I have seen the subpoena (Exhibit PBC). I am not the official custodian of the documents I have tendered. It is true that I instituted a direct criminal complaint against the 2nd Respondent but not on the same subject matter.

OLANIPEKUN:

I seek to tender the complaint between Mike Enahoro- Ebah v. Bola Tinubu Charge No. CR/121/2022 in evidence.

UCHE:

I object to the admissibility of the document.

I shall give my reasons later.

COURT:

The document titled DIRECT CRIMINAL COMPLAINT on case No. CR/121/2022 is hereby admitted in evidence as Exhibit XX1.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2 23/6/2023 SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023 SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

CROSS-EXAMINATION

Of PW27 Continue:

The proceeding on Exhibit XX1 is now on going because the Chief Magistrate decline. It merely abated as no formal Court order was made. There was no Ruling dismissing or striking out the matter. It was an administrative decision by the Chief Magistrate. I have seen Exhibit PDF3. I downloaded it from the internet. I did not find out from the Guinean Embassy whether the 2nd Respondent renounced the Guinean Passport. The Exhibit at the Data page indicates that it expired in 2020.

I did not bother to read through the pleadings of the Petition. I would therefore not know whether what I am testifying on forms part of the petition. I have seen paragraph 146 of the Petition. I have also seen paragraph 146 of the Petition. It hits the Documents to be relied in the Petition.

The judgment of the US District Court is not registered in Nigeria. I am not aware that in answer to any inquiry by the Nigerian Police, the United States consulate Mike to state that the 2nd Respondent was never convicted for any offence in the United States. I am aware that Chicago University wrote to say that the 2nd Respondent graduated from that University.

OLANIPEKUN:

I seek to tender the Letter from the Chicago

University in evidence.

UCHE:

We object to the admissibility and will advance our

reasons subsequently.

PINHEIRO:

No objection.

FAGBEMI:

No objection.

COURT:

The letter from Chicago State University titled "To

whom it may concern" dated 27/6/2022 is

admitted in evidence. It is to be marked as Exhibit

XX2.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN

23/6/2023

SGD. M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF MEMBER 2

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

CROSS-EXAMINATION By OLANIPEKUN:

There are differences between criminal and civil forfeiture in the United States. I have seen Exhibit PBF1. By the Exhibit there was no criminal trial. I would not want anyone to scandalise me.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

By FAGBEMI:

I have seen Exhibit PBF1. I agree that Chicago State University is a public Institution established in 1867. Exhibit PBF1 does not contain a certificate under the hand of a Police Officer in the United States. It does not contain the picture or finger print.

I have seen Exhibit PBE5. Those documents. There is no certification because they do not require certification. I have seen paragraph 146 of the Petition. I am not a member of APC. I am a member of the Obedient Movement of the Labour Party.

RE-EXAMINATION:

None.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

	SGD.	
Μ.	O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF	
	MEMBER 2	
	23/6/2023	

SGD. S. J. ADAH MEMBER 1 23/6/2023

SGD. A.B. MOHAMMED MEMBER 4 23/6/2023

SGD. M. B. UGO MEMBER 3 23/6/2023

Chief UCHE:

At this point in time, we wish to inform the Court that this is our last witness. We therefore pursuant to paragraph 46 (5) of the First Schedule to the Electoral Act apply to close the case for the Petitioners.

PINHEIRO: We plead with the Court to permit the 1st Respondent

to open their case after the Sallah Break.

OLANIPEKUN: Counsel for all the parties had met and agreed that

the Respondents will open their case on 3/7/23. We

hope to start open and close our cases that week.

FAGBEMI: I confirm that we had that understanding.

UCHE: In the spirit of cooperation we have so agreed.

COURT: Petition is adjourned to the 3/7/23 for Defence at

2.00p.m.

SGD. H. S. TSAMMANI CHAIRMAN 23/6/2023

SGD. SGD.

M. O. BOLAJI-YUSUFF S. J. ADAH
MEMBER 2 MEMBER 1
23/6/2023 23/6/2023

SGD. SGD.

A.B. MOHAMMED M. B. UGO

MEMBER 4 MEMBER 3

23/6/2023 23/6/2023